

MINUTES

**Historic Preservation Commission
Community Development Conference Room
January 9, 2003
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Cathy Johnson, Chairperson
B. J. Gonzales
Doug Sydnor
Tom Lennon
Patricia Myers
Janet Wilson
Ed Wimmer

Staff: Debbie Abele
Bob Cafarella
Don Meserve
Cathy Eley

MINUTES

Commissioner Sydnor recommended the following changes:

Page 2, Paragraph 2, add new sentence at the end *"Mr. Allen also noted that the existing conference room across the main street is a potential Trader Vic's restaurant."*

Page 2, Paragraph 4, "... deal with that issue *including a reinterpretation of the existing shading panels that rotate per Ken Allen.*"

Page 2, Paragraph 7, "... in the fall of 2004, *not 2003 as stated in an earlier Commission meeting.*"

Page 5, Paragraph 1, "... this case because of *a call from the owner's...*:

Page 5, Paragraph 2, "... with an overall *presentation on* ~~of~~ the historic..."

Commissioner Wilson recommended the following changes:

Page 3, Paragraph 4, "...She suggested *the City* ~~they~~ send two... that stated *the owner complies* ~~comply~~ with the above..."

Chairperson Johnson stated that the minutes of December 12, 2002 stood approved as amended.

ELECT CHAIRPERSON AND VICE-CHAIR

Chairperson Johnson stated that Commissioner Myers has submitted her resignation.

COMMISSIONER WILSON MOVED THAT COMMISSIONER MYERS' RESIGNATION BE ACCEPTED, NOTING THAT IT WAS WITH REGRET. MOTION WAS SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WIMMER, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY 6-0 (COMMISSIONER MYERS DID NOT VOTE)

Commissioner Wilson nominated Chairperson Johnson to continue to be the Chairperson. Commissioner Gonzales seconded the nomination. Chairperson Johnson accepted the nomination. NOMINATION VOTE PASSED 6-0.

Commissioner Wimmer nominated Commissioner Gonzales to be the Vice-Chair. Commissioner Wilson seconded the nomination. Commissioner Gonzales accepted the nomination. MOTION PASSED 6-0.

SCHEDULE FOR PRESENTATIONS ON RECOMMENDED INCENTIVES FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION

Ms. Abele commented that the list of organizations that the Commission was needing to contact to schedule meetings to discuss incentives was included in their packets. Ms. Abele commented that the first meeting had been held today.

Commissioner Sydnor stated that he and staff had met with the Scottsdale Area Downtown Task Force this morning and that they had highlighted the incentives in a short presentation.

Mr. Meserve noted that they had given those present the approved text on incentives, a list of current HP properties and the incentives graph.

Ms. Abele commented that those who were in attendance were supportive.

Commissioner Sydnor commented that the next meeting he was attending was the Downtown Scottsdale Partnership on January 16, 2003 at 7:30 A.M.

Mr. Meserve commented that this meeting was going to be held at the Hilton Plaza.

Commissioner Wilson stated that she is working on scheduling a meeting with the Scottsdale Historical Society.

Ms. Abele stated that she was working on scheduling a meeting with the Scottsdale Cultural Council.

Commissioner Gonzales commented that the Scottsdale Board of Realtors would not be meeting until February.

Commissioner Sydnor suggested forwarding correspondence to those groups that they aren't able to meet with prior to the City Council hearing on incentives and that it would need to be sent out very soon.

Commissioner Wimmer asked if they were locked into the February 3, 2003 City Council meeting.

Mr. Cafarella stated that they may be able to change the date, depending on the Council's agendas for a future meeting.

Commissioner Wimmer commented that more groups they had met with prior to the hearing to gain their support, the better it would be.

Commissioner Sydnor asked how moving the incentives hearing date would affect the hearing for Hotel Valley Ho.

Mr. Cafarella stated that the City Council would like to have the framework on incentives prior to the Hotel Valley Ho hearing.

Commissioner Sydnor asked if a two-week delay would affect the Hotel Valley Ho hearing.

Mr. Cafarella stated that it would not and that he would work on moving the hearing date. Mr. Cafarella suggested that the Commission set up one-on-one meetings with each individual Council member prior to the incentives going to City Council.

The Commission concurred and decided the following meeting assignments:

Mayor Manross	Commissioner Sydnor
Councilwoman Lukas	Commissioner Wilson
Councilman Ortega	Commissioner Wilson
Councilman O'Hearn	Commissioner Wimmer
Councilman Silverman	Commissioner Sydnor
Councilman Littlefield	Commissioner Gonzales
Councilman Ecton	Chairperson Johnson

Chairperson Johnson asked if a staff member should attend these meetings as well.

Mr. Cafarella stated that that he felt that it wasn't necessary. Mr. Cafarella stated that he would work on rescheduling the incentives hearing to the March 3 or 4, 2003 City Council meeting.

Commissioner Sydnor suggested that the Commissioners meet with their assigned Council members no sooner than three weeks prior to the hearing date.

Chairperson Johnson asked Commissioner Sydnor if he would give the incentives presentation to the City Council at the hearing.

Commissioner Sydnor agreed.

Mr. Cafarella stated that staff would prepare a packet for the Commission and City Council.

Commissioner Sydnor suggested making an executive summary of the Incentive Summary.

Chairperson Johnson suggested staff prepare a fact sheet of the thirteen recommended incentives for Commissioners to use in their meetings with Council.

Commissioner Wimmer suggested a thumbnail of photographs that show the need for incentives.

Commissioner Sydnor commented that he would need to rehearse the presentation to the City Council.

JANUARY 22ND FRIENDS OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION BREAKFAST

Ms. Abele stated that getting together with supporters for breakfast had been discussed and that Janie Ellis has offered to host it at Cattletrack. Ms. Abele suggested practicing the incentives presentation on them to get their feedback.

Chairperson Johnson asked how it was being decided who to invite.

Ms. Abele stated that staff was compiling a list of HP applicants, those on committees, and other supporters. Ms. Abele noted that since the incentives hearing was being postponed, there was not a need to hold the breakfast in January and that she would work on scheduling it for the middle of February.

UPDATE ON HOTEL VALLEY HO SCHEDULE AND NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION

Ms. Abele stated that Part I of the application had been returned and that they need to do a Case for Exceptional Significance since it is not yet fifty years old. Ms. Abele distributed the draft significance statement. Ms. Abele noted that the developer could get a \$3 million credit towards their rehabilitation costs.

Commissioner Sydnor asked if they could state that this was the only property like this in the State or even the Southwest.

Ms. Abele responded that they could definitely say it was the only one like this in the State. Ms. Abele asked the Commission to provide feedback on the significance statement as soon as possible.

Ms. Abele commented that the Hotel was scheduled to open in the Fall, 2004. Ms. Abele noted that the HP plan would also now include revisions to the development standards on zoning relating to height and setbacks and that they would need to go to the Planning Commission as well as to the City Council.

Ms. Abele stated that the HP Plan would be heard by the Commission on January 23, 2003 and that she would like to schedule a work study session on January 16, 2003.

Ms. Abele commented that Trader Vic's restaurant would be moving back to the Hotel, as the building it was going in has been deemed structurally unsound.

Commissioner Wilson commented that she would not be able to attend the work study session.

Mr. Cafarella stated that staff would meet with those Commissioners who could not attend at another time.

Chairperson Johnson noted that the work study session would begin at 5:00 PM.

ANNUAL REPORT ON ARCHAEOLOGICAL SURVEYS AND ARCHAEOLOGY

Mr. Meserve distributed the written annual report to the Commission, noting that it was similar to what was handed out at the joint meeting with the McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission. Mr. Meserve noted that the number of surveys was down from last year. Mr. Meserve also noted that there were now only two consultants this year instead of three because Entranco no longer has an archaeology division.

Mr. Meserve reviewed the draft Scottsdale Archaeology Overview report with the Commission, and advised them that he is continuing to edit the draft based upon the editing comments he has received from other staff.

Chairperson Johnson stated that once the minor revisions have been made, the report would be complete and it would then be time to approve it. She asked Mr. Meserve to send the revised draft to the Commission for review and he agreed.

HPO/STAFF REPORT

Mr. Cafarella stated that the City is intending to move or demolish the two Noriega Houses and expand the parking. Mr. Cafarella commented that the City might wait 6 – 8 months before demolition to see if the Community would be willing to move the houses. Mr. Cafarella noted that Ms. Ellis has a location in

Cattletrack for one of the houses. Mr. Cafarella commented that moving the houses would be extremely costly, so the likelihood that they would be moved is minimal.

Mr. Cafarella commented that the Noriega family does not feel that the homes need to be preserved. Mr. Cafarella commented that there will be a memorial plaque for Mr. Noriega, and that there would also be an information kiosk on the contribution of the Hispanic culture at the parking location.

Commissioner Wimmer asked if it was possible to save a portion of the wall to be used in the kiosk.

Ms. Abele commented that it may be feasible.

Mr. Cafarella noted that it may go to City Council on January 21, 2003.

Chairperson Johnson asked who owned the houses.

Mr. Cafarella stated that the City did.

Commissioner Wilson commented that she liked the idea of using a portion of the wall.

Commissioner Sydnor commented that at the beginning of the Commission's existence, it was felt that the eastern home may be worth saving, noting that since then Ms. Abele has pointed out in order to be significant that it would need to be in its original context. Commissioner Sydnor noted that the Commission may want to ask one more time if it was worthy of consideration for preservation.

Commissioner Myers noted that the buildings are in disrepair and that they have been modified.

Chairperson Johnson asked if an oral history has been done on the Noriega family.

Mr. Cafarella stated that if it hasn't been done already, it would be.

Commissioner Myers commented that Lois McFarland had interviewed the family.

Mr. Cafarella stated that he would provide an update to the Commission.

BUILDING CONDITION ASSESSMENT REPORTS

Mr. Meserve stated that the Commission had requested a full copy of the building condition assessment report on Our Lady of Perpetual Help Mission Church and that it had been included in their packets.

Chairperson Johnson suggested that Councilman Ortega receive a copy of this report.

Ms. Abele suggested that it be given to him when the assigned Commissioner meets with him on the incentives and gave an additional copy of the report to Commissioner Wilson for Councilman Ortega.

Commissioner Sydnor commented that this is a very valuable document.

REVIEW DRAFT AGENDA FOR JANUARY 25TH ANNUAL RETREAT

Ms. Abele reviewed the draft agenda with the Commission. Ms. Abele commented that she would like input from the Commission on the agenda.

Commissioner Sydnor suggested that working through any ordinance changes should be postponed for a few months.

Commissioner Wimmer concurred. The Commission agreed.

COMMITTEE REPORTS AND/OR MEETING DATES

Historic Register Committee: Ms. Abele stated that the Committee was meeting on January 15, 2003 to discuss the theory of districts and that the first six months of agendas have been planned out.

Chairperson Johnson commented that she would like to see more community members on the Historic Register Committee. Ms. Abele suggested talking about Committees at the Friends Breakfast.

Education Outreach Committee: Commissioner Wilson stated that they have not scheduled a meeting.

Incentives Committee: Commissioner Sydnor stated that they have not scheduled a meeting.

HPO/STAFF REPORT

Mr. Meserve stated that the Parada del Sol route this year would be from South to North and that the Scottsdale Historical Society was interested in sharing the flatbed with the Commission.

Ms. Able stated that the Valley National Bank HP case was removed from the February City Council meeting. Ms. Abele noted that Commissioner Sydnor had spoken to the property owner and that they would be scheduling a meeting with Mr. George Getz to discuss the case.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENTS

Commissioner Sydnor commented that regarding the Valley National Bank HP case that he had called George Getz and talked with him about it and that Mr. Getz was concerned with the negative press about his not supporting the HP recommendation and that he admitted that he did not understand everything about the recommendations. Commissioner Sydnor noted that they may or may not be able to get his support but that Mr. Getz was willing to meet and discuss it.

Commissioner Myers commented that she was resigning with regrets, noting that she would be traveling more with her work and that she would try to stay involved as time permits. Commissioner Myers also commented that being on the Commission has been a great experience and that she has learned a lot.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

No future items were discussed.

Meeting adjourned at 6:55 P.M.

Submitted by:

Cathy Eley
Recording Secretary

1903min